November 24, 2014

Secretary Tom Vilsack  
U.S. Department of Agriculture  
1400 Independence Ave., SW, Room 200-A  
Washington, DC 20250

Administrator Gina McCarthy  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 1101A  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NS  
Washington, DC 20460

Re: White House Task Force to Protect Pollinators

Dear Secretary Vilsack and Administrator McCarthy,

On June 20, 2014, President Obama issued the White House Memorandum “Creating a Federal Strategy to Promote the Health of Honey Bees and Other Pollinators.” As scientists and researchers in the fields of agroecology, agronomy, biology, chemistry, ecology, ecotoxicology, entomology, and sustainability sciences, among others, we applaud this initiative.

Since 2006, honey bees have suffered serious declines in the U.S. Wild bees such as bumble bees have also undergone long-term declines. These losses are not sustainable given the vital role bees play in our agricultural system and economies.

The 108 signers of this letter therefore urge you to take immediate action to protect bees and other pollinators, particularly from pesticides known to be harmful.

Beekeepers across the country are facing unsustainable annual losses. The average loss rate reported by U.S. beekeepers over the past 8 years has been 29.6% — well over the self-reported acceptable mortality rate. According to the Bee-informed Partnership, the entire 12-month period between April 2012 and April 2013 yielded an average loss of 49.4%.1 Beekeepers who managed bees from the April 2013 to April 2014 survey period reported an annual loss rate of 34.2%.2 And these losses directly impact the agricultural economy: the annual value of pollination services from honey bees and other pollinators has been estimated at more than $19 billion.3

A growing body of scientific evidence is showing connections between pollinator declines and pesticide exposure.4 A recent set of scientific reviews, known as the Worldwide Integrated Assessment of the Impact of Systemic Pesticides on Biodiversity and Ecosystems (WIA), involved 29 scientists reviewing over 800 studies, mostly on neonicotinoid insecticides. The WIA described these pesticides as impacting “individual navigation, learning, food collection, longevity, resistance to disease, and fecundity.”5

Neonicotinoid insecticides: widespread usage, environmental contamination

Multiple routes of exposure to pesticides during the growing season have been identified for honey bees near agricultural fields.6 Neonicotinoids are systemic pesticides that are
used mainly in seed treatments, but are also applied as foliar sprays and directly to soil. These insecticides are absorbed by the plant and can be transported into stems, leaves, flowers and fruit. Neonicotinoid residues have been found in pollen, nectar and droplets of water exuded by the plant.7–9 This feature makes the plant effectively toxic to insects that could potentially cause crop damage, resulting in protection for the plant.10 However, this also results in increasing their exposure potential to pollinators. Neonicotinoid-laced dust released into the environment during the planting of coated seeds (for example, corn seeds) has been documented as an additional route of exposure.11

Because usage for seed coatings is exempt under FIFRA’s “treated article exemption” and is not publicly tracked with the exception of California, it is not possible to accurately determine the amounts of neonicotinoids used annually in the United States.

Neonicotinoids are also relatively persistent and have been documented as persistent contaminants of surface water and soil.12–15

**Neonicotinoids have an adverse effect on honey bees**

Neonicotinoid-coated corn seeds have been identified as a direct cause of honey bee mortality, in the form of exposure to dust from the planting of coated seeds and droplets of water of corn plants germinated from coated seeds.8,11

Sub-lethal effects of neonicotinoids on homing ability, learning and foraging ability — all of which are skills contributing to the survival of bees — have been well documented or reviewed by multiple investigators— a few are cited here.9,16–18 A plausible molecular mechanism by which neonicotinoids impair neural signaling has been proposed.19,20

**Honey bees may be indicators of impacts on non-target organisms**

Another consequence of neonicotinoid use is the potential chronic exposure for non-target organisms, including wild pollinators and a wide range of aquatic invertebrates. The WIA recently concluded, “Despite large knowledge gaps and uncertainties, enough knowledge exists to conclude that existing levels of pollution with neonicotinoids ... are thus likely to have large-scale and wide ranging negative biological and ecological impacts on a wide range of non-target invertebrates...”18

Honey bee declines may be indicative of the larger problem of adverse impacts on populations of wild bees and other pollinators such as butterflies. While growers frequently rely on managed honey bees, studies indicate that wild pollinators provide valuable ecosystem services, in some cases fully pollinating crops.21 A recent study examining 41 crop systems worldwide found that the contribution by wild pollinators to fruit set — which can be taken as a reliable predictor of crop yield — was independent of that made by managed honey bees, and that the contribution by wild pollinators was universally positive in all crop systems examined.22 Concerns regarding potential impacts on other non-target organisms have been raised recently by the WIA and in a *Nature* article examining associations between high surface-water concentrations of a neonicotinoid and declines of insectivorous birds in the Netherlands.23
The European Food Safety Authority recently recommended further evaluation of the health risks of the developmental neurotoxicity potential of the neonicotinoids acetamiprid and imidacloprid.24

Questions around efficacy & impact

In addition to impacts on pollinators, questions remain regarding the efficacy and additional risks associated with widespread use of neonicotinoids on non-target arthropods, including beneficial insects. Nearly all of the corn seeds in the U.S. are sold pre-treated with a combination of insecticide and fungicide, leaving farmers of this major commodity crop with little choice of seeds in many regions of the U.S.25 However, studies reviewing efficacy of neonicotinoids on common corn or soy pests have indicated mixed results with regards to yield, calling into question the efficacy of such prophylactic usage.26,27 Most recently, U.S. EPA concluded that neonicotinoid treatments of soybeans provide little to no benefit to production.28

A 2014 review of the literature by the Center for Food Safety (CFS) examined 19 articles on seed treatment and yields of major U.S. crops, finding either no yield benefit or inconsistent yield benefit from such treatments. In cases where reduced pest damage or other benefits were determined, these benefits did not translate into increased yield in the studies reviewed by CFS. Prophylactic use occurs regardless of whether or not pest populations reach economic thresholds, contrary to the principles of Integrated Pest Management, and thus the costs of seed treatment “tends to exceed that of other control options...”29

Recommendations

We recommend that the Task Force prioritize the following three actions in order to better protect bees and other valuable pollinators:

1. Establish a moratorium on the use of neonicotinoids
2. Suspend the registrations of neonicotinoids for agricultural and cosmetic uses pending the completion of EPA’s review. (The European Union is currently in the first year of such a moratorium on certain neonicotinoids.)
3. Increase investment in research and funding for implementation of alternatives, and especially non-pesticidal alternatives, to neonicotinoids.

Short of a suspension of all neonicotinoid registrations, we recommend a suspension of neonicotinoid seed treatments and cosmetic uses of neonicotinoids.

Meanwhile, and until neonicotinoids are suspended for use, we recommend the the Task Force move swiftly to:

- Require all neonicotinoid seed treatments to be labeled as pesticides under FIFRA;
- Require a bee hazard statement to be included on the label of all products containing systemic insecticides toxic to pollinators, including soil drenches and foliar use products;
- Prioritize systemic insecticides for Registration Review starting in 2015, and ensure inclusion of independent, peer-reviewed research on the acute and chronic effects of systemic insecticides on bees and other essential pollinators;
Expedite the development and implementation of valid test guidelines for sub-lethal effects of pesticides on pollinators and require data from these studies for all currently registered and any new systemic pesticides; and

Require registrants to submit toxicity endpoint data for acute and sub-lethal effects for both adult and larval bees, and other bee species to account for potential differences in sensitivity.

Finally, the White House Task Force should recommend incentives for farmers to create healthy pollinator habitats in the form of diversified, pesticide-free landscapes as an alternative to our current system of intensive monoculture. Such landscapes support natural enemies also, and thus provide an alternative to pesticides. Maintaining high-quality habitats around farms aids in promoting pollinator richness and diversity. Thriving populations of beneficial insects result in a healthier and more resilient crop as well as benefiting the larger ecosystem.30 Practices that encourage wild pollinator diversity are therefore likely to increase crop yields and support the agricultural economy.

While gaps do exist in knowledge around neonicotinoids, regulation with an eye to prevention of harm, precaution with regards to neonicotinoids, and commitment to safe and sustainable alternatives may well help to stem the tide of pollinator losses. We ask the White House Task Force to deliver recommendations to our regulatory agencies urging swift and decisive action as outlined above, to protect bees and other pollinators.

Cc: White House

Signed, *

Emily Marquez, Ph.D.
Staff Scientist, Pesticide Action Network

* Institutional affiliations provided for identification purposes only

To reply to the signers please contact: Paul Towers, Organizing & Media Director, 1611 Telegraph Ave, #1200, Oakland, CA 94612 email: ptowers@panna.org; tel: 415.625.9072; fax: 415.981.1991
Signing on behalf of:

Molly Anderson, Ph.D.
Partridge Chair in Food and Sustainable Agriculture Systems
College of the Atlantic

Parker Anderson, M.A.
University of Michigan

Richard D. Andrews, M.S.
President, Boulder Innovative Technologies, Inc.

Joshua Arnold, Ph.D. candidate
Graduate student, Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management
University of California, Berkeley

Catherine Badgley, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology
University of Michigan

Rebecca A. Behar-Johnson, M.S.W.
California State University, Long Beach/University of California, Irvine

Alan Berkowitz, Ph.D.
Head of Education, Department of Biology
Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies

Rachel Bezner-Kerr, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, Department of Agricultural Sciences
Cornell University

Laura Burkle, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor, Department of Ecology
Montana State University

Robyn Burnham, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology
Michigan University

Brendan Carson, M.S.
Research Associate, Institute for Environmental Sustainability
Loyola University Chicago

M. Jahi Chappell, Ph.D.
Program Director, Agroecology and Agriculture Policy
Institute for Agriculture and Trade Policy
Eric Chivian, M.D.
Director, The Program for Preserving the Natural World, Inc.
Associate, Department of Organismic and Evolutionary Biology
Harvard University Founder and Director Emeritus, Center for Health and the Global Environment
Harvard Medical School

Patrick Christie, Ph.D.
Professor, International Studies
University of Washington

Hamutahl Cohen, Ph.D. candidate
Graduate student, Department of Zoology
University of California, Santa Cruz

Caroline Cox, M.S.
Research Director, Environmental Science, Policy, and Management
Center for Environmental Health

Kathryn De Master, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor of Agriculture, Society, and the Environment
Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management
University of California, Berkeley

Laura Driscoll, Ph.D. candidate
Graduate student, Department of Entomology
University of California, Berkeley

Jennie Durant, Ph.D. candidate
Graduate student, Department of Environmental Health
University of California, Berkeley

Naim Edwards, M.S.
Alumnus, Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology
University of Michigan

Tahira Farooqui, Ph.D.
Research Scientist, Department of Entomology
The Ohio State University
Kaleigh Fisher, M.A. candidate
Graduate student, University of Michigan

Gordon Fitch, M.S. candidate
Graduate student, Department of Development Sociology
University of Michigan

Michelle Fournier, M.S.
Co-author of study on honey bee population decline in Michigan
Department of Natural Resources and Environment
University of Michigan, Ann Arbor

James L. Frazier, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus, Department of Entomology, Center for Chemical Ecology, Center for Pollinator Research
The Pennsylvania State University

William Friedland, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus, Department of Sociology
University of California, Santa Cruz

Emily Gallagher, Ph.D. candidate
Graduate student, Department of Geography
Clark University

Stephen Gliessman, Ph.D.
Emeritus Professor, Department of Environmental Studies
University of California, Santa Cruz

Katherine Goodall, Ph.D.
Botany Fellow, Department of Environmental Studies
Wellesley College

John Graham, Ph.D. Candidate
Graduate student
University of Michigan, Ann Arbor

Doug Gurian-Sherman, Ph.D.
Director of Sustainable Agriculture and Senior Scientist
Center for Food Safety

Michael Huebert, D.V.M.
Swine Specialist and Beekeeper
Fairfield, NE
Joseph Hunt, Ph.D.
Senior Scientist, Center for Health and Global Environment
Harvard University

Alastair Iles, J.D.
Professor, Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management
University of California, Berkeley

Marcia Ishii-Eiteman, Ph.D.
Senior Scientist
Pesticide Action Network

Johanna Jacobi, Ph.D.
Postdoctoral researcher, Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management
University of California, Berkeley

Emily Kearney, Ph.D. candidate
Graduate student, Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management
University of California, Berkeley

Susan Kegley, Ph.D.
Principal and CEO, Pesticide Research Institute
Berkeley, CA

Christina M. Kennedy, Ph.D.
Senior Scientist, Development by Design Program
The Nature Conservancy

Claire Kremen, Ph.D.
Professor, Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management
University of California, Berkeley

Carol Landry, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, Department of Ecology, Evolution and Organismal Biology
The Ohio State University

Adrian Lu, J.D.
Graduate student, Department of Environmental Studies
University of California, Berkeley

Chensheng Lu, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, School of Public Health
Harvard University
Luis Malaret, Ph.D.
Professor, Department of Biology
Community College of Rhode Island

Kathleen McAfee, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, Department of International Relations
San Francisco State University
Fellow: Rachel Carson Center for Environment and Society
Ludwig Maximilian University, Munich, Germany

Nicholas Medina, M.S. candidate
Graduate student, Beekeeping Research Unit
University of Michigan, Ann Arbor

V. Ernesto Mendez, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, Department of Plant and Soil Science
University of Vermont

Albie Miles, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor, Department of Environmental Studies
University of Hawai‘i, West Oahu

Beatriz Moisset, Ph.D.
Writer

Maywa Montenegro, Ph.D. candidate
Graduate student, Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management
University of California, Berkeley

Ha Nguyen, Ph.D. candidate
Graduate student, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering
University of Michigan

Rachel O’Malley, Ph.D.
Professor and Acting Chair, Department of Environmental Studies
San Jose State University

Patty Oikawa, Ph.D.
Postdoctoral researcher, Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management
University of California, Berkeley

Elissa Olimpi, Ph.D. candidate
Graduate student, Department of Biology
University of California, Santa Cruz
Theresa Ong, Ph.D. candidate  
Graduate Student Instructor, Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology  
University of Michigan

Raj Patel, Ph.D.  
Research Professor, Lyndon B. Johnson School for Public Affairs  
University of Texas at Austin

Ivette Perfecto, Ph.D.  
Professor, School of Natural Resources and Environment  
University of Michigan, Ann Arbor

Stacy Philpott, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor, Environmental Studies Department  
Center for Agroecology and Sustainable Food Systems  
University of California, Santa Cruz

Warren Porter, Ph.D.  
Professor of Environmental Toxicology, Professor of Zoology  
University of Wisconsin, Madison

Alison Power, Ph.D.  
Professor, Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology  
Cornell University

John Quinn, Ph.D.  
Assistant Professor, Centre for Critical Developmental Studies  
Furman University

Margaret Reeves, Ph.D.  
Senior Scientist  
Pesticide Action Network

Dianne Rocheleau, Ph.D.  
Professor, Department of Geography  
Clark University

Hillary Sardiñas, Ph.D. candidate  
Department of Environmental Science, Policy and Management  
University of California, Berkeley

Jennifer Sass, Ph.D.  
Professorial Lecturer, Department of Environmental and Occupational Health  
George Washington University
Tatiana Schreiber, Ph.D.
Adjunct Faculty, Department of Environmental Studies
Keene State College

Lori Ann Thrupp, Ph.D.
University of California, Berkeley

Jun Tsuji, Ph.D.
Professor, Department of Biology
Siena Heights University

Chatura Vaidya, M.S.
Graduate student, School of Natural Resources
University of Michigan

S. Bradleigh Vinson, Ph.D.
Professor, Department of Entomology
Texas A&M University

Oane Visser, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor, Agrarian, Food and Environmental Studies
International Institute of Social Studies

Thomas Wassmer, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor, Department of Biology
Siena Heights University

Judy Wu-Smart, Ph.D. candidate
Research Assistant, Department of Environmental Science, Policy, and Management
University of Minnesota

Katherine Yih, Ph.D.
Epidemiologist, Population Medicine
Harvard Medical School

Wanyi Zhu, Ph.D.
Department of Entomology, Center for Pollinator Research
The Pennsylvania State University

**International**

Vanessa Amaral-Rogers, M.Sc.
Buglife, Member of the Taskforce on Systemic pesticides
Co-author of the Worldwide Integrated Assessment on Systemic Pesticides
United Kingdom
Lara Atkin, Ph.D. candidate
Queen Mary, University of London, United Kingdom

Luc Belzunces, Ph.D.
Director of Research, Environmental Toxicology
French National Institute for Agricultural Research (INRA), France

Dr. Jean-Marc Bonmatin
Centre de Biophysique Moléculaire
Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, Orléans, France

Laura Bortolotti, Ph.D.
Researcher, DipSA
Consiglio per la Ricerca e la Sperimentazione in Agricoltura, Rome, Italy

Madeleine Chagnon, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor, Department of Biological Sciences
Université du Québec à Montréal, Montréal, Québec, Canada

Heide-Marie Daniel, Ph.D.
Senior Scientist, Earth and Life Institute
Université catholique de Louvain, Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium

Miguel Escalona, Ph.D.
Professor, Facultad de Ciencias Agrícolas
Universidad Veracruzana, Xalapa, Mexico

Bruce G. Ferguson, Ph.D.
Chair, Department of Agriculture, Society, and Environment
El Colegio de la Frontera Sur, San Cristobal de las Casas, Chiapas, Mexico

Valerie Fournier, Ph.D.
Consultant, Phytologie
Université Laval, Quebec, Canada

Chiara Giorio, Ph.D.
Postdoctoral Research Associate, Department of Chemistry
University of Cambridge, United Kingdom

Yadira González, M.A.
Rural Development, Ciencias Sociales
Universidad Centroamericana UCA, Managua, Nicaragua

Noel Antonio González Valdivia, Ph.D.
Professor, Ecology and Botany
Tecnológico Nacional de México, México, D.F., México
Dave Goulson, Ph.D.
Professor, Department of Biology (Evolution, Behaviour, and the Environment)
University of Sussex, Brighton, United Kingdom

Fani Hatjina, Ph.D.
Researcher, Hellenic Agricultural Organization ‘DEMETER’
Hellenic Institute of Apiculture

S. Ryan Isakson, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor, Division of Social Sciences
University of Toronto, Canada

Ekaterina Kozuharova, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, Reader of Pharmaceutical Botany
Department of Pharmacology and Botany, Faculty of Pharmacy
MU-Sofia, Bulgaria

Stefano Maini, Ph.D.
Professor, Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology
University of Bologna, Bologna, Italy

Natalia Mamonova, Ph.D. candidate
ISS Erasmus, Rotterdam, The Netherlands

Dr. Rosemary Mason MB ChB FRCA
Former Physician, Anaesthesiologist
Wales, United Kingdom

Piotr Medrzycki, Ph.D.
Researcher, DipSA
Consiglio epr la Ricerca e la Sperimentazione in Agricoltura, Rome, Italy

Edward Mitchell, Ph.D.
Professor, Institute of Biology
University of Neuchâtel, Neuchâtel, Switzerland

Helda Morales, Ph.D.
Professor, Department of Agroecology
El Colegio de la Frontera Sur, San Cristobal de las Casas, Chiapas, Mexico

Jeff Ollerton, Ph.D.
Professor, Department of Environmental and Geographical Sciences,
University of Northampton, Northampton, United Kingdom
Claudio Porrini, B.A.
Environmental Science, Policy, and Management
Alma Mater Studiorum, University of Bologna, Bologna, Italy

Maria Teresa Renzi, Ph.D.
Ecology and Evolutionary Biology
University of Bologna, Bologna, Italy

Francisco Sanchez-Bayo, Ph.D.
Department of Plant and Food Sciences
The University of Sydney, New South Wales, Australia

Henk Tennekes, M.Sc., Ph.D.
Consultant Toxicologist
Author, The Systemic Insecticides: A Disaster in the Making
ETS Experimental Toxicology Services BV, Zutphen, The Netherlands

Fabio Sgolastra, Ph.D.
Researcher, Department of Agricultural Sciences
University of Bologna, Bologna, Italy

Simone Tosi, Ph.D. candidate
Department of Agricultural Sciences (DipSA)
University of Bologna, Bologna, Italy

A. Cristina de la Vega-Leinert, Ph.D.
Senior Scientist, Department of Geography
Ernst-Moritz-Arndt University, Greifswald, Germany

Carlos H. Vergara, Ph.D.
Professor, Departamento de Ciencias Quimico-Biologicas
Universidad de las Americas Puebla, Cholula, Puebla, Mexico

Penelope Whitehorn, Ph.D.
Research Fellow, Department of Biology and Environmental Science
University of Stirling, United Kingdom
References


24. EFSA Panel on Plant Protection Products and their Residues (PPR). Scientific Opinion on the developmental neurotoxicity potential of acetamiprid and imidacloprid. 11, 3471


